# Northumbria Research Link

Citation: Panitz, Sina, Salzmann, Ulrich, Risebrobakken, Bjørg, De Schepper, Stijn, Pound, Matthew, Haywood, Alan, Dolan, Aisling and Lunt, Daniel (2018) Orbital, tectonic and oceanographic controls on Pliocene climate and atmospheric circulation in Arctic Norway. Global and Planetary Change, 161. pp. 183-193. ISSN 0921-8181

Published by: Elsevier

URL: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloplacha.2017.12.022 < https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloplacha.2017.12.022 >

This version was downloaded from Northumbria Research Link: http://nrl.northumbria.ac.uk/id/eprint/32930/

Northumbria University has developed Northumbria Research Link (NRL) to enable users to access the University's research output. Copyright © and moral rights for items on NRL are retained by the individual author(s) and/or other copyright owners. Single copies of full items can be reproduced, displayed or performed, and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided the authors, title and full bibliographic details are given, as well as a hyperlink and/or URL to the original metadata page. The content must not be changed in any way. Full items must not be sold commercially in any format or medium without formal permission of the copyright holder. The full policy is available online: <a href="http://nrl.northumbria.ac.uk/policies.html">http://nrl.northumbria.ac.uk/policies.html</a>

This document may differ from the final, published version of the research and has been made available online in accordance with publisher policies. To read and/or cite from the published version of the research, please visit the publisher's website (a subscription may be required.)





# **1** Orbital, tectonic and oceanographic controls on Pliocene climate

# 2 and atmospheric circulation in Arctic Norway

- 3 Sina Panitz<sup>1</sup>, Ulrich Salzmann<sup>1</sup>, Bjørg Risebrobakken<sup>2</sup>, Stijn De Schepper<sup>2</sup>, Matthew J.
- 4 Pound<sup>1</sup>, Alan M. Haywood<sup>3</sup>, Aisling M. Dolan<sup>3</sup>, Daniel J. Lunt<sup>4</sup>
- <sup>5</sup> <sup>1</sup>Department of Geography and Environmental Sciences, Faculty of Engineering and
- 6 Environment, Northumbria University, Newcastle upon Tyne NE1 8ST, UK,
- 7 ulrich.salzmann@northumbria.ac.uk, matthew.pound@northumbria.ac.uk
- <sup>8</sup> <sup>2</sup>Uni Research Climate, Bjerknes Centre for Climate Research, Jahnebakken 5, 5007 Bergen,
- 9 Norway, bjorg.risebrobakken@uni.no, stijn.deschepper@uni.no
- <sup>3</sup>School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Woodhouse Lane, Leeds LS2 9JT,
- 11 UK, A.M.Haywood@leeds.ac.uk, A.M.Dolan@leeds.ac.uk
- <sup>4</sup>School of Geographical Sciences, University of Bristol, University Road, Bristol BS8 1SS,
- 13 UK, D.J.Lunt@bristol.ac.uk
- 14 **Corresponding author**: Sina Panitz (E-mail: sina.panitz@gmail.com)

#### 15 Abstract

- 16 During the Pliocene Epoch, a stronger-than-present overturning circulation has been invoked
- 17 to explain the enhanced warming in the Nordic Seas region in comparison to low to mid-
- 18 latitude regions. While marine records are indicative of changes in the northward heat
- 19 transport via the North Atlantic Current (NAC) during the Pliocene, the long-term terrestrial
- 20 climate evolution and its driving mechanisms are poorly understood. We present the first
- 21 two-million-year-long Pliocene pollen record for the Nordic Seas region from Ocean Drilling
- 22 Program (ODP) Hole 642B, reflecting vegetation and climate in Arctic Norway, to assess the

23 influence of oceanographic and atmospheric controls on Pliocene climate evolution. The 24 vegetation record reveals a long-term cooling trend in northern Norway, which might be 25 linked to a general decline in atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentrations over the studied interval, and 26 climate oscillations primarily controlled by precession (23 kyr), obliquity (54 kyr) and 27 eccentricity (100 kyr) forcing. In addition, the record identifies four major shifts in Pliocene 28 vegetation and climate mainly controlled by changes in northward heat transport via the 29 NAC. Cool temperate (warmer than present) conditions prevailed between 5.03–4.30 Ma, 30 3.90–3.47 Ma and 3.29–3.16 Ma and boreal (similar to present) conditions predominated 31 between 4.30–3.90 Ma, 3.47–3.29 and after 3.16 Ma. A distinct decline in sediment and 32 pollen accumulation rates at c. 4.65 Ma is probably linked to changes in ocean currents, 33 marine productivity and atmospheric circulation. Climate model simulations suggest that 34 changes in the strength of the Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation during the Early 35 Pliocene could have affected atmospheric circulation in the Nordic Seas region, which would have affected the direction of pollen transport from Scandinavia to ODP Hole 642B. 36

37 Keywords: pollen, vegetation, Pliocene, North Atlantic Current, Central American Seaway

#### 38 1. Introduction

39 During the Pliocene Epoch (5.33–2.59 Ma), global mean annual temperatures were 2–3°C 40 warmer than present (Haywood et al., 2013). Due to positive feedback mechanisms in the 41 Arctic, warming was particularly pronounced at high latitudes (Dowsett et al., 2013). On the 42 land masses surrounding the Nordic Seas, cool temperate and boreal forests reached further 43 north during the Pliocene into regions that are presently covered by subarctic boreal forests 44 and Arctic tundra (Bennike et al., 2002; Panitz et al., 2016; Verhoeven et al., 2013; Willard, 45 1994). The enhanced warming in the Nordic Seas region has been ascribed to a stronger than 46 present Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC) and thus North Atlantic

47 Current (NAC) (Haug et al., 2001; Raymo et al., 1996, 1992). However, an increase in the 48 strength of the AMOC during the Pliocene is not simulated by all climate models (Zhang et 49 al., 2013). In both marine and terrestrial climate model simulations for the Pliocene, 50 temperatures are underestimated at high latitudes and remain below temperatures based on 51 data reconstructions (Dowsett et al., 2013; Salzmann et al., 2013). Palaeogeographic 52 differences have been suggested to account for the data-model mismatch. Simulations with an 53 altered palaeogeography (North Atlantic and Baltic river input, lowered Greenland-Scotland 54 Ridge and exposed Barents Sea) show a strong high latitude warming and weaker AMOC 55 (Hill, 2015). Closing the Bering Strait and the Canadian Arctic Archipelago has been shown 56 to increase warming at high latitudes and to strengthen the AMOC (Otto-Bliesner et al., 57 2017). Model experiments to assess Pliocene terrestrial temperature change indicate that high 58 insolation, increased CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations and a closed Arctic gateway enhance high-latitude 59 warming (Feng et al., 2017). However, the low resolution and poor age control of most terrestrial records limit the quantification of data-model mismatch at high latitudes (Feng et 60 61 al., 2017).

62 Heat is transported to the Arctic Ocean via the Norwegian Atlantic Current (NwAC), the 63 continuation of the NAC in the eastern Nordic Seas. Pliocene marine records of sea surface 64 temperature (SST) and palaeoceanographic changes in the North Atlantic and Nordic Seas 65 indicate repeated variations in the northward heat transport via the NAC (Bachem et al., 2017; De Schepper et al., 2013; Lawrence et al., 2009; Naafs et al., 2010; Risebrobakken et 66 67 al., 2016). The development of a modern-like surface ocean circulation in the Nordic Seas around 4.5 Ma has been linked to the establishment of a northward flow through the Bering 68 69 Strait and a shoaling of the Central American Seaway (CAS) (De Schepper et al., 2015). In 70 Ocean Drilling Program (ODP) Hole 642B increased abundances of the dinoflagellate species 71 Protoceratium reticulatum after 4.2 Ma suggest increased Atlantic water influence at the site

72 and the establishment of a modern-like NwAC (De Schepper et al., 2015). Alkenone-derived 73 SSTs in Hole 642B show a pronounced cooling at 4.3 Ma, with temperature decreasing by 74  $\sim$ 5°C to values fluctuating around the Holocene average, which might be linked to a 75 strengthening of the East Greenland Current (EGC) and reduced amplitude of obliquity 76 forcing (Bachem et al., 2017). Carbon isotope changes in Hole 642B are indicative of a well-77 ventilated Norwegian Sea comparable to the present situation (Risebrobakken et al., 2016). 78 Increasing surface water densities have been inferred at the same site which may be the result 79 of increased Atlantic water influence already from 4.6 Ma (Risebrobakken et al., 2016). Early 80 Pliocene oceanographic changes in the Caribbean indicate that the shoaling of the CAS 81 between 4.8 and 4.0 Ma is associated with a strengthening of the AMOC (Groeneveld et al., 82 2008; Haug et al., 2001; Osborne et al., 2014; Steph et al., 2010). However, benthic carbon 83 and oxygen isotope records from the Atlantic suggest that deep water circulation remained 84 unaffected by the shoaling of the CAS (Bell et al., 2015). Neogene palaeofloras from North America and Western Eurasia indicate that the difference in the thermal gradients between 85 86 these two continents developed between the late Miocene and late Pliocene, possibly in 87 response to the intensification of the AMOC after the shoaling of the CAS during the early 88 Pliocene (Utescher et al., 2017). A pronounced warming in the Norwegian Sea took place 89 around 4.0 Ma in response to a strengthened northward heat transport potentially due to the 90 CAS shoaling or a deepening of the Greenland-Scotland Ridge (Bachem et al., 2017). The 91 presence of a warmer NwAC is supported by a corresponding depletion of planktic  $\delta^{18}$ O in 92 Hole 642B (Risebrobakken et al., 2016). Contemporaneous cooling in the Iceland Sea 93 resulted in the establishment of a strong zonal gradient and strengthened surface circulation 94 in the Nordic Seas (Bachem et al., 2017; Herbert et al., 2016). The presence of warm surface 95 waters in the Norwegian Sea might have contributed, in addition to regional tectonic uplift, to 96 the development of seasonal sea ice in the Eurasian sector of the Arctic Ocean around 4 Ma

97 (Knies et al., 2014) by enhancing evaporation and precipitation, and thus Arctic freshwater
98 supply (Bachem et al., 2017). The impact of these palaeoceanographic changes on the
99 terrestrial climate evolution in northern Norway and potential links to the shoaling of the
100 CAS are unknown.

101 For the Late Pliocene (Piacenzian, 3.60–2.58 Ma), SST reconstructions show a variable 102 pattern in the magnitude of warming, with the largest anomalies being recorded in the Iceland 103 and Greenland Seas (Dowsett et al., 2013; Knies et al., 2014; Schreck et al., 2013) and the 104 lowest in the Norwegian Sea (Bachem et al., 2017, 2016). Decreasing SSTs in the Norwegian 105 Sea between 3.65 and 3.30 Ma are suggested to be the result of a reduced influence of the 106 NAC on the NwAC (Bachem et al., 2017). A new multi-proxy study shows that during the 107 Piacenzian vegetation and climate changes in northern Norway coincide with variations in 108 Atlantic water influence and SST changes in the Norwegian Sea (Panitz et al., 2017). 109 Whereas most Pliocene terrestrial records show warmer-than-present climatic conditions, the 110 reconstruction of terrestrial climate evolution and variability before the onset of extensive 111 Pleistocene Northern Hemisphere Glaciation (NHG) has, however, been hampered by the 112 short temporal coverage of existing records in the Nordic Seas region (Bennike et al., 2002; 113 Verhoeven et al., 2013; Willard, 1994). Here, we investigate the relation between Pliocene 114 oceanographic changes in the North Atlantic and Nordic Seas and terrestrial climate changes 115 in northern Norway over a two-million-year long time period.

This study presents a Pliocene (5.03–3.14 Ma) high-resolution pollen record for the Nordic
Seas region, reflecting vegetation changes in northern Norway. The new Early Pliocene
pollen record from ODP Hole 642B is combined with the previously published Late Pliocene
pollen record from the same site (Panitz et al., 2016) and compared to SST and water mass
changes in the Norwegian Sea (Bachem et al., 2017; De Schepper et al., 2015; Risebrobakken
et al., 2016). Climate model output is presented to assess potential changes in pollen transport



**Figure 1**: Location of (A) the study area in the North Atlantic and (B) ODP Hole 642B in the Norwegian Sea. (C) Modern vegetation of Norway modified after Moen (1987). In (B), colour coding of currents indicates the relative temperature: dark orange = warm; light orange = moderately warm; blue = cold. EGC = East Greenland Current, NAC = North Atlantic Current and NwAC = Norwegian Atlantic Current.

to the site by wind in response to changes in AMOC strength due to the shoaling of the CAS.
The aim of this study is to assess (1) the long-term controls on vegetation and climate
changes in northern Norway, (2) the response of vegetation changes to the variability of the
NAC, and (3) the potential effects of early Pliocene oceanographic changes on pollen
transport to the site.

## 127 **2. Oceanographic setting and modern vegetation of Norway**

128 ODP Hole 642B was recovered during Leg 104 and is situated about 400–450 km off the

129 coast of Norway on the outer Vøring Plateau in the Norwegian Sea (67°13.2'N, 2°55.8'E,

130 1286 m water depth, Shipboard Scientific Party (1987); Figure 1). A branch of the NwAC,

131 which is an extension of the warm NAC, flows northward on either side of the plateau (Orvik

and Niiler, 2002). At present, the influence of these warm waters results in relatively mild

133 climatic conditions in Scandinavia (Furevik, 2000). Boreal forest extends over most of

134 Norway with pure deciduous forests only found along the south coast. The proportion of 135 deciduous and thermophilic elements decreases with increasing latitude, and altitude of the Scandinavian mountains (Moen, 1987). In southern Scandinavia, the altitudinal limit of the 136 137 tree line is reached at ~1200 m above sea level, with alpine tundra predominating beyond the 138 tree limit (Moen, 1999). The tree line steadily declines with increasing latitude until tundra 139 prevails at sea level in northernmost Norway (Moen, 1999, 1987). Based on the analysis of 140 two (sub)surface samples from Hole 642B, the pollen signal has been shown to be 141 representative of the prevailing vegetation in northern Norway (Panitz et al., 2016). The 142 predominance of wind-pollinated taxa in the (sub)surface and Pliocene samples suggests that 143 pollen is mainly transported to the site by wind. While plumes of cold fjord water enter the 144 Norwegian Sea during spring at present and extend up to 100 km offshore (Mork, 1981), such plumes most likely did not develop during the Pliocene due to the absence of fjords and a 145 146 reduced ice cover. There is no evidence of the existence of large rivers during the Pliocene, 147 with modest sedimentation along the Norwegian continental margin during the Middle 148 Eocene to Pliocene. Sedimentation rates increased greatly with the onset of NHG around 2.6 Ma (Eidvin et al., 2000; Faleide et al., 2008). 149

### 150 **3.** Materials and Methods

#### 151 **3.1.** Age model

152 The age model for the Pliocene section of ODP Hole 642B is based on the updated magnetic

- stratigraphy of Bleil (1989) to the ATNTS2012 time scale (Hilgen et al., 2012) and
- 154 correlation of the benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O curve from Hole 642B to the global LR04 benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O stack
- between 4.147 and 3.14 Ma (Lisiecki and Raymo, 2005; Risebrobakken et al., 2016). A major
- 156 hiatus exists in the Late Pliocene section of the record after 3.14 Ma (Bleil, 1989;
- 157 Risebrobakken et al., 2016). The tie points for the age model (Supplementary Table 1) are

158 shown alongside the sedimentation rate in Figure 3 (Risebrobakken et al., 2016), with

159 changes in sedimentation rate reflecting the position of the tie points.

# 160 **3.2.** Sample preparation and pollen analysis

161 A total of 128 samples were selected for pollen analysis between 83.55 and 66.95 metres 162 below sea floor (mbsf) from ODP Hole 642B, ranging in age from 5.03 to 3.14 Ma 163 (Risebrobakken et al., 2016). The samples were pre-sieved in Bergen, Norway through a 164 63 µm mesh to retain foraminifera for oxygen isotope analysis (Risebrobakken et al., 2016). 165 A potential bias in the pollen data due to the loss of larger Pinaceae grains has been excluded 166 by comparison of sieved and unsieved samples (Panitz et al., 2016). Sample preparation was 167 carried out at the Palynological Laboratory Services Ltd, North Wales and Northumbria 168 University, Newcastle, using standard palynological techniques (Faegri and Iversen, 1989). In 169 order to calculate pollen concentrations, one Lycopodium clavatum spore tablet was added to 170 each sample (Stockmarr, 1971). The treatment with cold HCl (20%) was followed by the use 171 of cold, concentrated HF (48%) to remove carbonates and silicates, respectively. An 172 additional wash with hot (c. 80°C) HCl (20%) was conducted to remove fluorosilicates. After 173 back-sieving the sediment through a 10 µm screen, the residue was mounted on glass slides 174 using glycerol-gelatine jelly. Pollen analysis was carried out using a Leica Microscope (DM 175 2000 LED) at magnifications of 400x and 1000x. The identification of pollen and spores was 176 aided by the pollen reference collection at Northumbria University and the use of literature 177 (e.g. Beug, 2004). Reworked pollen and spores were differentiated from in situ grains based 178 on the thermal maturity of the exine, with reworked grains having orange to brown colours, 179 and/or their presence outside their stratigraphic range. Particularly reworked gymnosperm 180 pollen showed a high degree of compression, a faint alveolar structure of the saccae and 181 mineral imprints (de Vernal and Mudie, 1989a, 1989b; Willard, 1996). In situ Lycopodium 182 *clavatum* spores differed in colour from the marker spores.

183 For the majority of samples more than 300 pollen and spore grains were counted. Only 20 184 samples yielded a total count of less than 300 grains. Percentages of pollen and spores were 185 calculated based on the pollen sum, excluding Pinus pollen as well as unidentified and 186 reworked pollen and spores. The pollen sum excluding Pinus pollen regularly exceeds 170 pollen and spores (for further detail see Supplementary Material). The software Tilia was 187 188 used to generate pollen diagrams and perform stratigraphically constrained cluster analysis for the delimitation of pollen zones (Grimm, 1990, 1987). Pollen accumulation rates (PARs) 189 190 were calculated based on the following formula:

$$191 \quad (1) \qquad \qquad \mathsf{PAR} = C \ge \rho \ge S$$

with PAR in grains/(cm<sup>2</sup> kyr), *C* being the pollen concentration (grains/g dry weight),  $\rho$  the dry bulk density (g/cm<sup>3</sup>) and *S* the sedimentation rate (cm/kyr). PARs have been calculated to compensate for fluctuations in the sedimentation rate that can affect pollen concentrations (Traverse, 1988). Pollen and spore taxa have been bioclimatically grouped following the modern distribution of their nearest living relatives (Table 1).

197	Table 1: Pollen and spore taxa from ODP Hole 642B attributed to the bioclimatic zones
198	plotted in Figure 6.

Bioclimate groups	Attributed pollen and spore taxa
Cool temperate forests	Carpinus, Carya, Corylus, Ilex, Ostrya, Pterocarya,
	Quercus, Sciadopitys, Taxus, Tsuga, Ulmus
Boreal forests	Abies, Alnus, Betula, Cupressaceae, Juniperus, Picea
Boreal and alpine peatlands	Asteraceae, Ericaceae, Lycopodium spp., Sphagnum
and heathlands	

#### 199 **3.3.** Time series analysis

200 In order to detect cyclicity within the vegetation changes, a continuous wavelet transform was 201 carried out using a Morlet wavelet (Torrence and Compo, 1998). Due to the low pollen 202 counts between 4.56 and 4.37 Ma, we only analysed the time interval from 4.37 to 3.14 Ma. 203 For wavelet analysis, the unevenly spaced data was interpolated on 1000-year time steps prior 204 to analysis in PAST3. In order to test whether peaks in the spectrum are significant against 205 the red-noise background, we applied REDFIT (Schulz and Mudelsee, 2002). The analyses 206 were performed on the relative abundance of *Pinus* pollen which dominates throughout the 207 record.

#### 208 **3.4.** Climate model description

209 Climate model output from the Hadley Centre coupled atmosphere-ocean climate model 210 (HadCM3, Gordon et al., 2000) has been used to assess potential changes in pollen transport 211 by wind to ODP Hole 642B in response to changes in AMOC strength, following the 212 shoaling of the CAS. Previous studies have shown that closing the CAS is an effective means 213 of increasing AMOC strength in a coupled atmosphere-ocean climate model (Lunt et al., 214 2008a, 2008b). HadCM3 has been shown to reproduce the large scale features of Pliocene 215 climate (Haywood et al., 2013). It has been used for a number of Pliocene climate modelling 216 studies and was the first coupled atmosphere-ocean climate model (Haywood and Valdes, 217 2004) to run using boundary conditions defined by the PRISM project based at the US Geological Survey. 218

The simulations shown here have used PRISM2 boundary conditions (following Dowsett et al., 1999). In one experiment the CAS is specified as open (hereafter referred to as OCAS) and the other the CAS is closed (hereafter referred to as CCAS; simulations are comparable to those presented in (Lunt et al., 2008b). These changes were made to assess the potential variability in AMOC strength on regional atmospheric circulation and pollen transport from

Scandinavia to ODP Hole 642B. We focus on the model output surface wind speeds and
atmospheric pressure during spring (March, April, May) as most plants disperse pollen during
that season.

227 **4. Results** 

#### 228 **4.1.** Pliocene pollen assemblages and vegetation reconstruction

The Pliocene pollen record of ODP Hole 642B is divided into six pollen zones (Figure 2).
The complete pollen record is provided in Supplementary Material Figure 1.

231 Pollen Zone 1

The lowermost pollen zone (PZ 1, 83.55-77.38 mbsf, 5.03-4.51 Ma, 15 samples, two 232 233 samples at the top of the zone were excluded from relative abundance calculations shown in 234 Figure 2 due to low counts) is characterised by high abundances of *Pinus* pollen and other 235 boreal to temperate coniferous tree and shrub taxa (Abies, Cupressaceae, Juniperus type, 236 Picea, Sciadopitys, Taxus and Tsuga). Together with the occurrence of temperate deciduous 237 taxa (Carpinus, Carya, Pterocarya and Quercus), PZ 1 is indicative of the presence of 238 diverse cool temperate mixed forests in northern Norway (Figure 2). Fluctuations in the 239 proportions of the temperate taxon Sciadopitys suggest that the interval was interrupted by 240 cooler intervals that were more boreal in character. Notable are the very high pollen 241 concentrations throughout PZ1 that decrease markedly at the top of the zone (Figure 2). The 242 environmental interpretation of the pollen assemblages at the transition from PZ 1 to PZ 2 is 243 hampered due to low pollen counts. The presence of mainly boreal tree and shrub taxa (Alnus, Betula, Ericaceae, Fraxinus, Juniperus type and Pinus) and mosses (Huperzia and 244 245 Sphagnum) may be an indication of the prevalence of boreal forests and tundra environments.





**Figure 2**: Abundances of pollen and spores and taxa groups in the Pliocene sediments of ODP Hole 642B. Coloured area for abundances of "other herbs" represents a 5-fold exaggeration of percentages (white area). Percentages of pollen and spores were calculated based on the pollen sum, excluding *Pinus*, unidentified and reworked pollen and spores. Only for the calculation of *Pinus* percentages were the counts of *Pinus* pollen included in the pollen sum. Depth is indicated in metres below sea floor (mbsf). Grey horizontal bar delimits samples with low pollen counts (<100). Samples with a total count of less than 40 grains are not shown. The lithology of the Pliocene section of Hole 642B was obtained from the original report (Shipboard Scientific Party, 1987).

The thermophilic but cold-tolerant taxon *Tsuga* is also present, presumably growing atfavourable sites (see Supplementary Material).

#### 249 Pollen Zone 2

In the middle part of pollen zone 2 (PZ 2, 76.60–75.29 mbsf, 4.30–4.15 Ma, 14 samples, two samples at the base of the zone were excluded from relative abundance calculations shown in Figure 2 due to low counts) the predominance of cool temperate forests is inferred from the

253 relative high abundance of *Sciadopitys* pollen. The subsequent decrease in the percentages of

*Sciadopitys* pollen and increase in the relative proportion of Asteraceae and Ericaceae pollen as well as *Lycopodium* spores (incl. *Lycopodium annotinum*, *Lycopodium clavatum*, *Lycopodium inundatum* and *Lycopodium* spp.; Figure 2) is interpreted to reflect a southward shift of cool temperate mixed forests and an opening of the vegetation at higher altitudes due to a lowering of the treeline, leading to the development of alpine herb fields/heathlands under a boreal climate.

#### 260 Pollen Zone 3

At the beginning of pollen zone 3 (PZ 3, 75.29–72.60 mbsf, 4.15–3.90 Ma, 19 samples), the relative abundance of *Pinus* pollen declines slightly whereas that of *Sphagnum* spores markedly increases. In conjunction with low proportions of other coniferous trees and shrubs taxa, these pollen assemblage changes suggest that boreal forest prevailed and peatlands expanded due to further cooling and/or wetter conditions (Figure 2).

#### 266 Pollen Zone 4

In pollen zone 4 (PZ 4, 72.60–69.02 mbsf, 3.90–3.47 Ma, 25 samples), pollen of *Pinus* and other coniferous trees and shrubs predominate the assemblages, suggesting a re-establishment of cool temperate climatic conditions in northern Norway (Figure 2).

#### 270 Pollen Zone 5

After this prolonged warm interval, the proportions of Asteraceae and Ericaceae pollen and *Lycopodium* spores increase in pollen zone 5 (PZ 5, 69.02–68.54 mbsf, 3.47–3.35 Ma, 9 samples, Figure 2), indicating an expansion of herb fields/heathlands at higher altitudes in response to the establishment of cooler climatic conditions and an associated lowering of the tree line. Together with the predominance of *Pinus* pollen and low abundances of other coniferous trees and shrubs, this suggests that boreal forests and alpine herb fields/heathlandsprevailed in northern Norway under subarctic climatic conditions.

#### 278 Pollen Zone 6

In the uppermost pollen zone (PZ 6, 68.54–66.95 mbsf, 3.35–3.14 Ma, 46 samples) the overall decline in the relative abundance of *Pinus* pollen and increasing proportion of *Sphagnum* spores is interpreted to represent the expansion of peatlands at the expanse of forests (Figure 2). Abundance peaks in the temperate taxon *Sciadopitys* point to reoccurring warmer, and thus highly variable, climatic conditions (Panitz et al., 2016). Throughout PZ 2 to 6, pollen concentrations are relatively low in comparison to those within PZ 1 (Figure 2).

#### 285 **4.2.** Climate model results

286 During Northern Hemisphere (NH) spring (March, April, May), model results for both 287 experiments indicate a predominantly westerly to southwesterly wind between 45°N and 288 ~65–70°N (Figure 4). Between ~65–70°N and 75°N the airflow is predominantly easterly in 289 the Nordic Seas. Whilst the dominant direction of flow south of ~65–70°N is predominantly 290 westerly to southwesterly, over the Scandinavian land mass the details of circulation are more 291 complex. In particular, we highlight in Figure 4 the region in central and northern 292 Scandinavia where there is a tendency for easterly flow. The tendency for easterly flow over 293 central and northern Scandinavia is enhanced in the OCAS scenario (Figure 4).

In the CCAS scenario, AMOC is increased relative to the OCAS scenario, with a

corresponding enhancement in ocean heat transport in the NH (see Lunt et al., 2008b). This in

turn alters the regional temperature and atmospheric pressure gradients over Northern Europe

and the Nordic Seas (Figure 4; Lunt et al., 2008b). The result of which is to encourage

stronger westerly and southwesterly flow (Figure 4), creating a corresponding suppression of

299 easterly flow from central and northern Scandinavia into the Nordic Seas in the CCAS

scenario (Figure 4). These results are most clearly expressed by surface wind and pressure
patterns (Figure 4), however we have examined the nature of circulation and pressure at
higher altitudes (not shown) in the atmosphere and in each case find the potential for easterly
flow from Scandinavia is enhanced in the weaker AMOC scenario (OCAS).

**304 5. Discussion** 

# 305 5.1. Pollen Accumulation Rates indicate changes in ocean and atmospheric 306 circulation at c. 4.6 Ma

307 A distinct decline in sedimentation rate, pollen concentration and PAR at c. 4.65 Ma (Figure 308 2 and 3) suggests that changes in atmospheric circulation, ocean currents and/or taphonomic 309 processes may have affected the transport, deposition and/or preservation of pollen (e.g. 310 Dupont, 2011). The strong correlation between PARs, which takes fluctuations in 311 sedimentation rates into account, and sedimentation rates in our record suggests potential 312 changes in the sedimentary regime or source area. We can confidently discard any major 313 influence of fluvial sediment transport from the Scandinavian mainland during the Pliocene. 314 During the Oligocene to Pliocene, the inner Norwegian Sea continental shelf was the main 315 depocentre for sediments from western Scandinavia. Hemipelagic sediments were deposited 316 on the shelf and pelagic ooze on the slope and rise (Eidvin et al., 2014). West of the 317 continental shelf, pelagic sedimentation (biogenic ooze) accumulated during the Oligocene to 318 Pliocene (Eidvin et al., 2014). ODP Hole 642B is located ~450 km off the Norwegian coast at 319 a water depth of ~1300 meter below sea level on the Vøring plateau, which was unaffected 320 by sediment supply from Scandinavia. The Hole 642B pollen record also shows a low 321 pollen/dinocyst (P/D) ratio (Figure 3) and a dominance of long-distance, wind-pollinated taxa 322 (such as *Pinus*, Figure 2), both indicating a very low influence of sea level and sediment 323 accumulation changes, if compared to Quaternary glacials and interglacials (McCarthy et al.,

325 proportions of reworked pollen grains or a shift in vegetation composition at 4.65 Ma (Figure 326 2), indicating that preservation issues or changes in pollen production on the mainland are an 327 unlikely cause for the decline in PAR. 328 At Hole 642B, stable carbon isotope values indicate an increase in bottom water ventilation 329 between 4.65 and 4.40 Ma, reaching values closer to the Holocene mean (Risebrobakken et 330 al., 2016). A decline in dinocyst and acritarch accumulation rates suggests a 331 contemporaneous reduction in primary productivity (De Schepper et al., 2015), which might 332 have affected the sinking of pollen grains to the sea floor (Dupont, 2011). These 333 oceanographic changes broadly coincide with the deep subsidence of the Hovgård Ridge in 334 the Fram Strait and the shoaling of CAS, with the latter resulting in an increased AMOC 335 (Haug et al., 2001; Risebrobakken et al., 2016; Steph et al., 2010). The Neogene AMOC and 336 its varying intensity prior to the closure of CAS during the Early Pliocene is a matter of 337 debate. Modelling results indicate that both oceanographic circulation and associated heat 338 transport were considerably reduced with an open CAS when compared to present-day 339 conditions (e.g. Lunt et al., 2008b), whereas palaeobotanical evidence suggests a Pliocene 340 steepening of the shallow thermal latitudinal gradients that existed in North America and 341 Western Eurasia throughout the Miocene (Utescher et al., 2017). These changes might have 342 also influenced the predominant mode of pollen transport which largely depends on the 343 regional climate and the distance of the site from the source area (Mudie and McCarthy, 344 2006). Today, the main atmospheric circulation pattern in the North Atlantic region is 345 determined by the difference in pressure between the subtropical Azores high and the 346 subpolar Icelandic low (Furevik, 2000). During the early Zanclean, atmospheric circulation 347 changes in the Nordic Seas region might have occurred in response to the shoaling of the CAS and its effect on the AMOC (Haug et al., 2001; Steph et al., 2010). 348

2003; McCarthy and Mudie, 1998). The pollen record does not show any change in the

324



**Figure 3**: Sedimentological data from ODP Hole 642B. (a) pollen (P) and dinoflagellate cyst

352 (D) ratio (De Schepper et al., 2015) and ice rafted debris (IRD) (Jansen et al., 1990); (b)

353 sedimentation rate and age control points based on magnetic reversals (diamonds) and

354 correlation of the benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O values to the LR04 global benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O stack (stars)

355 (Risebrobakken et al., 2016); (c) pollen concentrations and pollen accumulation rates (PARs)

356 (this study). Grey horizontal bar delimits samples with low pollen counts (<100).

357

350

358



**Figure 4**: Model predictions for wind vectors (arrows, m s<sup>-1</sup>) and mean sea level pressure (Pa) in spring (March, April, May) in the Nordic Seas region with an (a) open and (b) closed Central American Seaway (CAS). Black circle marks the location of ODP Hole 642B in the Norwegian Sea (67°N, 3°E). Black box shows an area in central/northern Scandinavia where the wind strength and direction changes significantly between the two simulations and is referred to within the main text.

359 To test the hypothesis of AMOC related atmospheric circulation changes affecting pollen 360 transport to Hole 642B (potentially, but not uniquely, associated with a shoaling of the CAS), mean surface wind velocities during spring were compared from experiments with an OCAS 361 362 and CCAS (Figure 4). In both experiments the predominant atmospheric flow in the Nordic 363 Seas is westerly and south-westerly. However, the pattern of atmospheric circulation over the 364 Scandinavian land mass is more complex. Of particular note, is the easterly flow moving out into the Nordic Seas over central and northern Scandinavia. This easterly flow is suppressed 365 in the CCAS scenario, therefore we suggest that the potential for pollen transport from 366 Scandinavia to Hole 642B is enhanced under weaker AMOC scenarios during the Pliocene 367 (e.g. OCAS). 368

369 Whilst the timing of CAS closure is widely debated, our HadCM3 simulations suggest that a

370 closing of the CAS could impact wind-fields over Norway (associated with an increase in the

371 AMOC with a closing CAS). Therefore, this provides a potential explanation for part of the

decrease in PAR after 4.65 Ma, as this lies within the uncertainty related to the timing of
CAS closure (Haug et al., 2001; Steph et al., 2010). However, we also acknowledge that there
are other potential mechanisms (e.g. palaeogeographic changes in the Arctic; Otto-Bliesner et
al., 2017) that could cause a change in Pliocene AMOC and are not associated with the
closure of CAS, which could therefore affect pollen deposition at Hole 642B.

377 5

## 5.2. Long-term cooling and climatic cyclicity

378 The Pliocene pollen record from Hole 642B reveals four major changes in vegetation and

379 climate in northern Norway, with cooler, boreal conditions developing at 4.30 Ma and 3.47

380 Ma and warmer, cool temperate conditions at 3.90 Ma and 3.29 Ma (Figure 2). These

381 changes are indicative of repeated latitudinal shifts of the northern boundary of the deciduous

382 forest zone. Possible controls on the long-term vegetation changes in northern Norway

383 include declining atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations and astronomical forcing.

384 Over the almost two-million-year-long record, the relative abundance of the thermophilic 385 taxon *Sciadopitys* shows a continuous decline during subsequent warm intervals (Figure 2). 386 At present, Sciadopitys is endemic to Japan where it thrives on well-drained slopes in a 387 temperate and wet climate (Ishikawa and Watanabe, 1986). During the Neogene, Sciadopitys 388 was a common element in the temperate forests of the Northern Hemisphere, forming part of 389 many different plant communities that inhabited diverse environments from lowland swamps 390 to high-altitude forests (e.g. Figueiral et al., 1999). In northern Norway, the decline of this 391 species throughout the Pliocene may be indicative of a progressive cooling of climate that is 392 also evident in other Pliocene terrestrial and marine records (e.g. Lawrence et al., 2009; Naafs 393 et al., 2010; Verhoeven et al., 2013). Decreasing atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentrations have been





**Figure 5**: (a) Spectral analysis based on continuous wavelet transform of the relative abundance changes of *Pinus* pollen. Signal power is shown with a colour scale (red = higher). The black contour line indicates the significance level corresponding to p=0.05; and (b) REDFIT power spectrum (black line) testing whether peaks in the spectrum are significant against the red-noise background (Schulz and Mudelsee, 2002). False-alarm confidence level (red line) has been set to 90%.

suggested to be the main driver for the long-term cooling throughout the Pliocene leading to
the onset of NHG (e.g. Lunt et al., 2008a; Martínez-Botí et al., 2015).

397 Continuous wavelet transform of *Pinus* pollen percentages reveals the influence of ~23-kyr

398 precession, ~40 and 54-kyr obliquity for some intervals and relatively strong ~100-kyr

399 eccentricity cycles (Figure 5). Low-frequency, large-amplitude changes linked to eccentricity

400 could also be identified in the stable oxygen and carbon isotope records from Hole 642B

401 (Risebrobakken et al., 2016). For the vegetation record, REDFIT identifies significance for

402 the 100-kyr eccentricity, 54-kyr obliquity and the 23-kyr precession cycles (Figure 5). A

403 dominance of precession cycles during the Pliocene has also been described from a

404 compilation of Mediterranean SSTs and marine biomarker accumulation (Herbert et al.,

405 2015). REDFIT could not identify significant 40-kyr obliquity cycles previously described

406 from other marine sites in the North Atlantic for the Early and Late Pliocene (Figure 5)

407 (Lawrence et al., 2009; Naafs et al., 2010). However, it should be noted that the spectral and
408 power spectrum analysis of the Hole 642B pollen record is limited due to the unevenly
409 distributed sampling interval, which likely explains why wavelet transform could identify
410 obliquity and precession cycles in two, relatively densely sampled intervals only. While
411 astronomical forcing appears to be present in the Pliocene vegetation changes in northern
412 Norway, palaeogeographic and palaeoceanographic changes during the studied time interval
413 seem to have had a stronger influence on the long-term climate evolution of Scandinavia.

## 414 **5.3.** Pliocene vegetation change and North Atlantic current variability

#### 415 **5.3.1. Zanclean (5.3–3.6 Ma)**

416 During the early Zanclean (5.03–4.51 Ma), cool temperate deciduous to mixed forests 417 prevailed in northern Norway (Figure 2). Whether pure deciduous or mixed forests existed in 418 the lowlands of the Scandinavian mountains is not clear from the pollen signal due to the low 419 abundances of deciduous elements (see also Panitz et al., 2016). The latter is an artefact of 420 the distance of the site from the shore which also results in the over-representation of *Pinus* 421 pollen (e.g. Mudie and McCarthy, 2006). The presence of deciduous or mixed forests in 422 northern Norway suggests a northward shift of the northern limit of these forest zones by 4– 423 8° latitude, corresponding to an increase in average annual and July temperatures of at least 424 2–4°C and 4°C, respectively (Moen, 1999). A similar magnitude of warming is observed in 425 alkenone-derived SST estimates from Hole 642B, with SSTs up to ~3°C higher than the 426 Holocene average between 5.0 and 4.64 Ma (Figure 6) (Bachem et al., 2017). The alkenone-427 derived SSTs are likely biased towards summer temperatures as the main growth period of 428 modern alkenone producing organisms occurs during the summer at higher altitudes due to 429 reduced incoming solar radiation during winter (Bachem et al., 2016 and references therein). 430 At ODP Site 982, which is situated in the path of the NAC before it enters the Norwegian

431 Sea, SSTs were ~6–12°C higher than present between 5.1 and 4.5 Ma (Figure 6) (Herbert et
432 al., 2016), indicating that warmer-than-present Atlantic water entered the Nordic Seas.

433 At c. 4.90–4.85 Ma, 4.72 Ma and 4.63 Ma, the establishment of boreal forests and the 434 development of peatlands at higher altitudes due to a lowering of the treeline are indicative of 435 cooler climatic conditions in northern Norway (Figure 2). Around 4.90–4.80 Ma, glacial 436 expansions have been inferred from ice-rafted debris (IRD) deposits in the Nordic Seas 437 (Fronval and Jansen, 1996; Jansen and Sjøholm, 1991; St. John and Krissek, 2002). In the 438 Norwegian Sea, IRD deposits point to the presence of sea-terminating glaciers around the 439 Nordic Seas at 4.9 Ma (Figure 3) (Bachem et al., 2017; Jansen et al., 1990). This cooling is 440 also recorded in alkenone-derived SST estimates from Hole 642B (Figure 6) (Bachem et al., 441 2017). Dinocyst assemblages from Hole 642B reveal the influence of warm temperate 442 Atlantic water in the Norwegian Sea during the early Zanclean, but show a cooling in the 443 warm/cold index around 4.90 Ma (Figure 6) (De Schepper et al., 2015). At the same time, enriched planktic and benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O values suggest increased surface and bottom water 444 445 densities due to lower water temperatures (Risebrobakken et al., 2016). The cooling is also 446 evident in alkenone-based SSTs from ODP Site 907 in the Iceland Sea (De Schepper et al., 447 2015; Herbert et al., 2016). The prevalence of mixed and boreal forests in northern Norway 448 around 4.90 Ma suggests that an extensive glaciation in Scandinavia is unlikely (Figure 2). 449 However, variable climatic conditions in northern Norway between 5.03 and 4.51 Ma are in 450 agreement with repeated cooling phases and related expansions of small-scale glaciations 451 around the Nordic Seas (Fronval and Jansen, 1996).

452 At Hole 642B, very low PARs occur between 4.56 and 4.37 Ma (Figure 2; see section 5.1 for

453 discussion). The pollen assemblage of the first sample above this interval is indicative of the

454 presence of boreal forests and tundra environments in northern Norway. This interpretation

455 should, however, be regarded with caution due to the low pollen counts. At 4.34 Ma, cool



457 Figure 6: Comparison of predominant vegetation and climate in northern Norway during the 458 Pliocene to other Pliocene marine and terrestrial proxy records in the Northern Hemisphere. 459 (a) relative abundance changes of the dinocyst cyst of *Protoceratium reticulatum* (yellow) 460 and the warm (W)/cold (C) water index (De Schepper et al., 2015); (b) relative abundance 461 changes of trees and shrubs at Lake El'gygytgyn in NE Siberia (Andreev et al., 2014); (c) 462 alkenone-derived sea surface temperature (SST) estimates at ODP Site 982 (orange) (Herbert 463 et al., 2016; Lawrence et al., 2009) and IODP Site U1313 (grey) and the 100 kyr moving 464 average (black) (Naafs et al., 2010); (d) SST estimates from ODP Hole 642B (Bachem et al., 2017); relative abundance changes of (e) cool temperate forest taxa, (f) boreal forest taxa and 465 466 (g) boreal and alpine peatland and heathland taxa. For climatic grouping see Table 1. Grey bar highlights the interval with low pollen accumulation rates and counts. 467

468 temperate mixed forests indicate climate conditions similar to those before the interval with 469 low PARs. At 4.30 Ma, the development of herb fields/heathlands at higher altitudes, 470 followed by the expansion of peatlands at 4.15 Ma and the prevalence of boreal forests, 471 suggests cooler climatic conditions until 3.90 Ma (Figure 2). This cooling on land coincides 472 with the development of a modern-like NwAC between 4.50 and 4.30 Ma, as indicated by the 473 appearance of cysts of Protoceratium reticulatum and an increase in cool-water dinocysts, 474 that indicate a spread of cooler but still temperate waters across the Norwegian Sea (Figure 6) (De Schepper et al., 2015). This is supported by planktic  $\delta^{18}$ O values from Hole 642B which 475 476 indicate an increase in surface water salinities and/or cooling after 4.65 Ma (Risebrobakken et 477 al., 2016). Alkenone-derived SST estimates for Hole 642B show a cooling at 4.30 Ma (Figure 478 6), suggesting reduced northward heat transport via the NAC (Bachem et al., 2017). At Site 479 982 in the North Atlantic, a slight cooling between 4.3 and 4.0 Ma coincides with 480 reconstructed temperature changes at Hole 642B (Figure 6). However, it should be noted that 481 the full SST variability at Site 982 is likely not recorded due to the low temporal resolution 482 (see also Lawrence et al., 2009). At ODP Site 907 in the Iceland Sea, the gradual 483 disappearance of dinocyst species between 4.50 and 4.30 Ma likely reflects decreasing water 484 temperatures and salinity due to the establishment of a proto-EGC (Schreck et al., 2013). The 485 increased export of cool Arctic waters into the Nordic Seas via a modern-like EGC has been 486 linked to the prolonged establishment of northward water flow through the Bering Strait, 487 possibly as a result of the shoaling of the CAS (De Schepper et al., 2015; Schreck et al., 488 2013; Verhoeven et al., 2011).

489 In northern Norway, diverse mixed forests and temperate climatic conditions re-established at

490 3.90 Ma (Figure 2). This warming is preceded by a rise in SSTs in the Norwegian Sea by

491 ~6°C between 4.0 and 3.93 Ma (Figure 6) (Bachem et al., 2017) and reduced surface water

492 densities (Risebrobakken et al., 2016), suggesting an increased inflow of warm Atlantic water

493 as a result of an enhanced northward heat transport, following the shoaling of the CAS (Steph 494 et al., 2010). The magnitude of warming seen in the Norwegian Sea ( $+ -5^{\circ}$ C compared to the 495 Holocene average) is comparable to an inferred increase of July temperatures of at least 4°C 496 in northern Norway, based on the latitudinal shift of vegetation zones (Moen, 1999). The 497 warming in northern Norway also coincides with the emergence of seasonal sea ice in the 498 Eurasian sector of the Arctic Ocean, with an increased sea ice export possibly 499 counterbalancing the northward heat transport via a stronger AMOC (Knies et al., 2014). This 500 is supported by Pliocene stable oxygen and carbon isotope records from Hole 642B, which 501 indicate the presence of a warmer NwAC and a vigorous upper water column circulation 502 between 4.0 and 3.65 Ma (Risebrobakken et al., 2016).

503 **5.3.2.** Piacenzian (3.6–2.6 Ma)

504 In northern Norway, temperate climatic conditions prevailed until 3.47 Ma (Figure 2), 505 corresponding to SSTs up to 6°C higher than present in the Norwegian Sea and North 506 Atlantic, indicating northward transport of warm Atlantic surface water (Figure 6) (Bachem 507 et al., 2017; Lawrence et al., 2009; Naafs et al., 2010). At Hole 642B, a sharp decline in the 508 relative abundance of coniferous trees and shrubs (excluding *Pinus*) between 3.48 and 509 3.46 Ma leads to the predominance of boreal forest and indicates a change towards subarctic 510 climate conditions in northern Norway. This cooling coincides with a distinct decrease in 511 alkenone-derived SST by ~2°C in the Norwegian Sea at 3.45 Ma (Figure 6) (Bachem et al., 512 2017). There is also indications for an increase in surface water densities in response to 513 decreasing temperatures (Risebrobakken et al., 2016). A cooling is also recorded at Integrated 514 Ocean Drilling Program (IODP) Site U1313 at the north-eastern edge of the subtropical gyre 515 around 3.48–3.47 Ma (Figure 6) (Naafs et al., 2010). Following a brief warming at 3.45 Ma at Site U1313, a subsequent gradual decline in SSTs suggests a weakened NAC and northward 516 517 heat transport (Naafs et al., 2010). A long-term cooling of alkenone-derived SSTs at ODP

Site 982 in the northern North Atlantic, starting at 3.5 Ma, is indicative of a gradual change of climate before the intensification of NHG (Lawrence et al., 2009). At Site 982, obliquitydriven high-amplitude SST variations during the Piacenzian are superimposed by a long-term cooling trend (Figure 6). Lawrence et al. (2009) propose that the high amplitude variations at Site 982 were caused by changes in the position of the westerlies as a result of orbitally forced insolation changes, affecting the position of the NAC.

524 At 3.29 Ma, corresponding to the onset of warm climatic conditions during the mid-

525 Piacenzian (3.264–3.025 Ma), a return of cool temperate forests to northern Norway is in 526 agreement with an increase in alkenone-derived SSTs by ~3°C in the Norwegian Sea (Figure 527 6) (Bachem et al., 2017; Panitz et al., 2017). A decrease in surface water densities at the site 528 is also indicative of the presence of warmer waters in the Norwegian Sea (Risebrobakken et 529 al., 2016). A northward shift of the NAC and accompanied re-establishment of northward 530 heat transport is inferred from an increase in SSTs, and dinocyst assemblage changes around 531 3.29–3.28 Ma at several sites in the North Atlantic (De Schepper et al., 2013; Naafs et al., 532 2010). In the Norwegian Sea, however, the warming is not associated with changes in 533 Atlantic water influence, suggesting that shifts in the position of the NAC are restricted to the 534 North Atlantic. Instead, the increase in marine and terrestrial temperatures coincides with an 535 increase in obliquity, resulting in a strengthening of the seasonal contrast (Panitz et al., 2017). 536 In the North Atlantic and Nordic Seas region, climatic conditions seem to be slightly colder 537 during the mid-Piacenzian than before 3.47 Ma, as seen in colder average SSTs at Site U1313 538 (Naafs et al., 2010), and a lower relative abundance of Sciadopitys pollen in the pollen 539 assemblages of Hole 642B (Figure 6). In the Norwegian Sea, SSTs are on average only 1°C 540 lower during the mid-Piacenzian than between 3.65 and 3.45 Ma (Figure 6) (Bachem et al., 541 2017, 2016). An expansion of peatlands and decline in the prevalence of boreal forests in

northern Norway until 3.14 Ma are indicative of a cooling climate before the onset of NHG
around 2.7 Ma (Panitz et al., 2016).

544 In NE Siberia, a similar pattern to the climatic changes observed at Hole 642B and Site 545 U1313 is recorded in the relative abundance changes of trees and shrubs in the vicinity of 546 Lake El'gygytgyn (Figure 6) (Andreev et al., 2014). While the vegetation opens around 547 c. 3.47 Ma and c. 3.45 Ma, a pronounced decline in the relative abundance of trees and shrubs 548 does not take place until c. 3.39 Ma. Warmer conditions establish after c. 3.28 Ma, with 549 relative abundances of trees and shrubs accounting for >50% (Andreev et al., 2014). Changes 550 in vegetation and climate are also recorded in northwest Africa around 3.48 Ma, with warmer 551 and wetter conditions prevailing before and drier climatic conditions after 3.48 Ma (Leroy 552 and Dupont, 1997). The first extensive aridification in northwest Africa at 3.26 Ma 553 corresponds to the onset of the mid-Piacenzian, and is marked by the establishment of cool 554 temperate conditions in Norway. The similarity between the different Northern Hemisphere 555 records suggests that the observed climatic changes have a common forcing.

#### 556 **6.** Conclusions

Our new high-resolution pollen record from ODP Hole 642B in the Nordic Seas enables the 557 558 reconstruction of long-term climate evolution in the Norwegian Arctic during the Pliocene. 559 The record shows multiple changes from warmer-than-present cool temperate to near-modern 560 boreal conditions which are superimposed by a long-term cooling trend throughout the 561 Pliocene. A comparison of vegetation changes with palaeoceanographic changes in the 562 Nordic Sea allowed the identification of different climate forcings: shifts to a warmer-than-563 present Pliocene vegetation and climate with deciduous or mixed forests in northern Norway 564 (northward shift of  $4-8^{\circ}$  latitude, average annual and July temperatures  $> +2-4^{\circ}C$  and  $4^{\circ}C$ , 565 respectively) correspond to enhanced northward heat transport via the NAC and NwAC,

566 whereas boreal vegetation and climate occurred when northward heat transport was weaker. 567 During the Early Pliocene, we suggest that a marked decline in PARs (c. 4.65 Ma) may have 568 been caused by oceanographic and atmospheric circulation changes. Climate model 569 experiments suggest that pollen transport to the site may have been reduced after c. 4.65 Ma 570 due to changes in the atmospheric circulation pattern linked to an enhanced AMOC. An 571 increase in AMOC might have been caused by the shoaling of the CAS between 4.8 and 572 4.2 Ma. A gradual decrease of relative abundances of *Sciadopitys* pollen over subsequent 573 warm phases suggests a long-term cooling of climate, possibly in response to declining 574 atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations throughout the Pliocene. Astronomical forcing could also be 575 identified within the vegetation record, particularly a 100-kyr cycle. However, distinct 576 changes in vegetation and climate were linked to changes in the northward heat transport via 577 the NAC. Our Pliocene pollen record from Hole 642B suggests that palaeogeographic and 578 palaeoceanographic changes had a strong influence on the long-term climate evolution of 579 Scandinavia during the Pliocene. To further understand land-sea linkages and climate forcing 580 under warmer-than-present conditions, additional high-resolution studies along the 581 Scandinavian coast are required, recording the spatial extent of marine and terrestrial 582 environmental changes.

#### 583 7. Acknowledgements

We would like to thank the International Ocean Drilling Program for providing the samples.
We acknowledge the work of M. Jones (Palynological Laboratory Services Ltd) and Lesley
Dunlop (Northumbria University) in helping with the preparation of samples. The work is
part of the "Ocean Controls on high-latitude Climate sensitivity – a Pliocene case study"
(OCCP) project funded by the Norwegian Research Council (project 221712). SDS also
acknowledges support from the Norwegian Research Council (project 229819). AMH and

- 590 AMD acknowledge that this work was completed in receipt of funding from the European
- 591 Research Council under the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007–
- 592 2013)/ERC grant agreement no. 278636. We thank Paul Bachem for discussions of the results
- that aided data interpretation. We are grateful for comments from T. H. Donders and
- anonymous reviewer, which improved the manuscript.

# 595 **8.** Declaration of interest

596 Conflicts of interest: none.

# 597 9. References

- Andreev, A.A., Tarasov, P.E., Wennrich, V., Raschke, E., Herzschuh, U., Nowaczyk, N.R.,
  Brigham-Grette, J., Melles, M., 2014. Late Pliocene and Early Pleistocene vegetation
  history of northeastern Russian Arctic inferred from the Lake El'gygytgyn pollen record.
  Clim. Past 10, 1017–1039. doi:10.5194/cp-10-1017-2014
- Bachem, P.E., Risebrobakken, B., De Schepper, S., McClymont, E.L., 2017. Highly variable
  Pliocene sea surface conditions in the Norwegian Sea. Clim. Past 13, 1153–1168.
  doi:10.5194/cp-13-1153-2017
- Bachem, P.E., Risebrobakken, B., McClymont, E.L., 2016. Sea surface temperature
  variability in the Norwegian Sea during the late Pliocene linked to subpolar gyre
  strength and radiative forcing. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 446, 113–122.
  doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2016.04.024
- Bell, D.B., Jung, S.J.A., Kroon, D., Hodell, D.A., Lourens, L.J., Raymo, M.E., 2015. Atlantic
  Deep-water Response to the Early Pliocene Shoaling of the Central American Seaway.
  Sci. Rep. 5, 12252. doi:10.1038/srep12252
- Bennike, O., Abrahamsen, N., Bak, M., Israelson, C., Konradi, P., Matthiessen, J.,
  Witkowski, A., 2002. A multi-proxy study of Pliocene sediments from Île de France,
  North-East Greenland. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 186, 1–23.
- Beug, H.J., 2004. Leitfaden der Pollenbestimmung für Mitteleuropa und angrenzende
  Gebiete. Dr. Friedrich Pfeil, München.
- Bleil, U., 1989. 40. Magnetostratigraphy of Neogene and Quaternary Sediment Series from
  the Norwegian Sea: Ocean Drilling Program, Leg 104. Proc. Ocean Drill. Program, Sci.
  Results 104, 829–901.
- De Schepper, S., Groeneveld, J., Naafs, B.D.A., Van Renterghem, C., Hennissen, J., Head,
  M.J., Louwye, S., Fabian, K., 2013. Northern Hemisphere Glaciation during the
  Globally Warm Early Late Pliocene. PLoS One 8, e81508.
  doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0081508
- De Schepper, S., Schreck, M., Beck, K., Matthiessen, J., 2015. Early Pliocene onset of
  modern Nordic Seas circulation due to ocean gateway changes. Nat. Commun. 6, 1–8.
  doi:10.1038/ncomms9659
- de Vernal, A., Mudie, P.J., 1989a. Pliocene and Pleistocene palynostratigraphy at ODP Sites
  646 and 647, eastern and southern Labrador Sea, in: Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling
  Program, Scientific Results. Ocean Drilling Program College Station, Texas, pp. 401–
  422.
- de Vernal, A., Mudie, P.J., 1989b. Late Pliocene to Holocene palynostratigraphy at ODP Site
  645, Baffin Bay, in: Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling Program, Scientific Results. pp.
  387–399.
- bowsett, H.J., Barron, J.A., Poore, R.Z., Thompson, R.S., Cronin, T.M., Ishman, S.E.,
  Willard, D.A., 1999. Middle Pliocene paleoenvironmental reconstruction: PRISM2.
  USGS Open File Rep.

- 637 Dowsett, H.J., Foley, K.M., Stoll, D.K., Chandler, M.A., Sohl, L.E., Bentsen, M., Otto-638 Bliesner, B.L., Bragg, F.J., Chan, W.-L., Contoux, C., Dolan, A.M., Haywood, A.M., Jonas, J.A., Jost, A., Kamae, Y., Lohmann, G., Lunt, D.J., Nisancioglu, K.H., Abe-639 640 Ouchi, A., Ramstein, G., Riesselman, C.R., Robinson, M.M., Rosenbloom, N.A., Salzmann, U., Stepanek, C., Strother, S.L., Ueda, H., Yan, Q., Zhang, Z., 2013. Sea 641 Surface Temperature of the mid-Piacenzian Ocean: A Data-Model Comparison. Sci. 642 Rep. 3, 1-8. doi:10.1038/srep02013 643 644 Dupont, L., 2011. Orbital scale vegetation change in Africa. Quat. Sci. Rev. 30, 3589-3602. 645 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2011.09.019 646 Eidvin, T., Jansen, E., Rundberg, Y., Brekke, H., Grogan, P., 2000. The upper Cainozoic of 647 the Norwegian continental shelf correlated with the deep sea record of the Norwegian 648 Sea and the North Atlantic. Mar. Pet. Geol. 17, 579-600. doi:10.1016/S0264-649 8172(00)0008-8 650 Eidvin, T., Riis, F., Rasmussen, E.S., 2014. Oligocene to Lower Pliocene deposits of the Norwegian continental shelf, Norwegian Sea, Svalbard, Denmark and their relation to 651 652 the uplift of Fennoscandia: A synthesis. Mar. Pet. Geol. 56, 184–221. 653 doi:10.1016/j.marpetgeo.2014.04.006 654 Faegri, K., Iversen, J., 1989. Textbook of Pollen Analysis. Wiley&Sons, Chichester.
- Faleide, J.I., Tsikalas, F., Breivik, A.J., Mjelde, R., Ritzmann, O., Øyvind, E., Wilson, J.,
  Eldholm, O., 2008. Structure and evolution of the continental margin off Norway and
  the Barents Sea. Episodes 31, 82–91.
- Feng, R., Otto-bliesner, B.L., Fletcher, T.L., Tabor, C.R., Ballantyne, A.P., Brady, E.C.,
  2017. Amplified Late Pliocene terrestrial warmth in northern high latitudes from greater
  radiative forcing and closed Arctic Ocean gateways. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 466, 129–
  138. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2017.03.006
- Figueiral, I., Mosbrugger, V., Rowe, N.P., Ashraf, A.R., Utescher, T., Jones, T.P., 1999. The
  miocene peat-forming vegetation of northwestern Germany: An analysis of wood
  remains and comparison with previous palynological interpretations. Rev. Palaeobot.
  Palynol. 104, 239–266. doi:10.1016/S0034-6667(98)00059-1
- Fronval, T., Jansen, E., 1996. Late Neogene paleoclimates and paleoceanography in the
  Iceland-Norwegian Sea: evidence from the Iceland and Vøring Plateaus. Proc. Ocean
  Drill. Program, Sci. Results 151, 455–468.
- Furevik, T., 2000. Large-scale atmospheric circulation variability and its impacts on the
  Nordic seas ocean climate: A review. Nord. Seas An Integr. Perspect. Geophys. Monogr.
  Ser. 158, 105–136.
- Gordon, C., Cooper, C., Senior, C.A., Banks, H., Gregory, J.M., Johns, T.C., Mitchell, J.F.B.,
  Wood, R.A., 2000. The simulation of SST, sea ice extents and ocean heat transports in a
  version of the Hadley Centre coupled model without flux adjustments. Clim. Dyn. 16,
  147–168. doi:10.1007/s003820050010
- 676 Grimm, E.C., 1990. TILIA and TILIA\* GRAPH. PC spreadsheet and graphics software for
   677 pollen data. INQUA, Work. Gr. Data-Handling Methods Newsl. 4, 5–7.

- 678 Grimm, E.C., 1987. CONISS: a FORTRAN 77 program for stratigraphically constrained
  679 cluster analysis by the method of incremental sum of squares. Comput. Geosci. 13, 13–
  680 35.
- Groeneveld, J., Nürnberg, D., Tiedemann, R., Reichart, G.-J., Steph, S., Reuning, L., Crudeli,
  D., Mason, P.R.D., 2008. Foraminiferal Mg/Ca increase in the Caribbean during the
  Pliocene: Western Atlantic Warm Pool formation, salinity influence, or diagenetic
  overprint? Geochemistry, Geophys. Geosystems 9, GC1564.
- 685 doi:10.1029/2006GC001564
- Haug, G.H., Tiedemann, R., Zahn, R., Ravelo, A.C., 2001. Role of Panama uplift on oceanic
   freshwater balance. Geology 29, 207–210. doi:10.1130/0091 7613(2001)029<0207:ROPUOO>2.0.CO;2
- Haywood, A.M., Hill, D.J., Dolan, A.M., Otto-Bliesner, B.L., Bragg, F., Chan, W.-L.,
  Chandler, M.A., Contoux, C., Dowsett, H.J., Jost, A., Kamae, Y., Lohmann, G., Lunt,
  D.J., Abe-Ouchi, A., Pickering, S.J., Ramstein, G., Rosenbloom, N.A., Salzmann, U.,
  Sohl, L., Stepanek, C., Ueda, H., Yan, Q., Zhang, Z., 2013. Large-scale features of
  Pliocene climate: results from the Pliocene Model Intercomparison Project. Clim. Past 9,
  191–209. doi:10.5194/cp-9-191-2013
- Haywood, A.M., Valdes, P.J., 2004. Modelling Pliocene warmth: contribution of atmosphere,
  oceans and cryosphere. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 218, 363–377.
- Herbert, T.D., Lawrence, K.T., Tzanova, A., Peterson, L.C., Caballero-Gill, R., Kelly, C.S.,
  2016. Late Miocene global cooling and the rise of modern ecosystems. Nat. Geosci. 9,
  843–849. doi:10.1038/ngeo2813
- Herbert, T.D., Ng, G., Cleaveland Peterson, L., 2015. Evolution of Mediterranean sea surface
   temperatures 3.5–1.5 Ma: Regional and hemispheric influences. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.
   409, 307–318. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2014.10.006
- Hilgen, F.J., Lourens, L.J., Van Dam, J.A., 2012. Chapter 29 The Neogene Period, in: The
  Geologic Time Scale. Elsevier, Burlington, MA, USA, pp. 923–978. doi:10.1016/B9780-444-59425-9.00029-9
- Hill, D.J., 2015. The non-analogue nature of Pliocene temperature gradients. Earth Planet.
   Sci. Lett. 425, 232–241. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2015.05.044
- Ishikawa, S., Watanabe, N., 1986. An ecological study on the Sciadopitys verticillata forest
  and other natural forests of Mt. Irazu, southern Shikoku, Japan. Mem. Fac. Sci. Kochi
  Univ. Ser. D Biol. 7, 63–66.
- Jansen, E., Sjøholm, J., 1991. Reconstruction of Glaciation over the Past 6 Myr from Ice Borne Deposits in the Norwegian Sea. Lett. to Nat. 349, 600–603.
- Jansen, E., Sjøholm, J., Bleil, U., Erichsen, J., 1990. Neogene and Pleistocene glaciations in
  the northern hemisphere and late Miocene Pliocene global ice volume fluctuations:
  evidence from the Norwegian Sea, in: Geological History of the Polar Oceans: Arctic
  versus Antarctic. Springer Netherlands, pp. 677–705.
- Knies, J., Cabedo-Sanz, P., Belt, S.T., Baranwal, S., Fietz, S., Rosell-Melé, A., 2014. The
  emergence of modern sea ice cover in the Arctic Ocean. Nat. Commun. 5, 5608.

#### 719 doi:10.1038/ncomms6608

- Lawrence, K.T., Herbert, T.D., Brown, C.M., Raymo, M.E., Haywood, A.M., 2009. Highamplitude variations in North Atlantic sea surface temperature during the early Pliocene
  warm period. Paleoceanography 24, PA2218. doi:10.1029/2008PA001669
- Leroy, S.A.G., Dupont, L.M., 1997. Marine palynology of the ODP Site 658 (N-W Africa)
   and its contribution to the stratigraphy of late Pliocene. GEOBIOS 30, 351–359.
- Lisiecki, L.E., Raymo, M.E., 2005. A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally distributed
   benthic δ18O records. Paleoceanography 20, PA1003.
- Lunt, D.J., Foster, G.L., Haywood, A.M., Stone, E.J., 2008a. Late Pliocene Greenland
   glaciation controlled by a decline in atmospheric CO2 levels. Nature 454, 1102–1105.
- Lunt, D.J., Valdes, P.J., Haywood, A., Rutt, I.C., 2008b. Closure of the Panama Seaway
  during the Pliocene: implications for climate and Northern Hemisphere glaciation. Clim.
  Dyn. 30, 1–18. doi:10.1007/s00382-007-0265-6
- Martínez-Botí, M.A., Foster, G.L., Chalk, T.B., Rohling, E.J., Sexton, P.F., Lunt, D.J.,
  Pancost, R.D., Badger, M.P.S., Schmidt, D.N., 2015. Plio-Pleistocene climate sensitivity
  evaluated using high-resolution CO2 records. Nature 518, 49–54.
  doi:10.1038/nature14145
- McCarthy, F.M.G., Gostlin, K.E., Mudie, P.J., Hopkins, J.A., 2003. Terrestrial and Marine
  Palynomorphs As Sea-Level Proxies : an Example From Quaternary Sediments on the
  New Jersey Margin , U. S. a. Soc. Sediment. Geol. 119–129.
- McCarthy, F.M.G., Mudie, P.J., 1998. Oceanic pollen transport and pollen:dinocyst ratios as
  markers of late Cenozoic sea level change and sediment transport. Palaeogeogr.
  Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol. 138, 187–206. doi:10.1016/S0031-0182(97)00135-1
- Moen, A., 1999. National Atlas of Norway: vegetation. Norwegian Mapping Authority,
   Hønefoss, Norway.
- Moen, A., 1987. The regional vegetation of Norway; that of central Norway in particular.
  Nord. Geogr. Tidsskr. 41, 179–226.
- Mork, M., 1981. Circulation phenomena and frontal dynamics of the Norwegian coastal
   current. Philos. Trans. R. Soc. London 302, 635–647.
- Mudie, P.J., McCarthy, F.M.G., 2006. Marine palynology: potentials for onshore offshore
   correlation of Pleistocene Holocene records. Trans. R. Soc. South Africa 61, 139–157.
- Naafs, B.D.A., Stein, R., Hefter, J., Khélifi, N., De Schepper, S., Haug, G.H., 2010. Late
  Pliocene changes in the North Atlantic Current. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 298, 434–442.
  doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2010.08.023
- Orvik, K.A., Niiler, P., 2002. Major pathways of Atlantic water in the northern North Atlantic
  and Nordic Seas toward Arctic. Geophys. Res. Lett. 29, 2-1-2–4.
  doi:10.1029/2002GL015002
- Osborne, A.H., Newkirk, D.R., Groeneveld, J., Martin, E.E., Tiedemann, R., Frank, M., 2014.
   The seawater neodymium and lead isotope record of the final stages of Central

758 American Seaway closure. Paleoceanography 29, 715–729. doi:10.1002/2014PA002676 759 Otto-Bliesner, B.L., Jahn, A., Feng, R., Brady, E.C., Hu, A., Löfverström, M., 2017. 760 Amplified North Atlantic warming in the late Pliocene by changes in Arctic gateways. Geophys. Res. Lett. 44, 957-964. doi:10.1002/2016GL071805 761 762 Panitz, S., De Schepper, S., Salzmann, U., Bachem, P.E., Risebrobakken, B., Clotten, C., 763 Hocking, E.P., 2017. Mid-Piacenzian variability of Nordic Seas surface circulation 764 linked to terrestrial climatic change in Norway. Paleoceanography 32, PA003166. 765 doi:10.1002/2017PA003166 766 Panitz, S., Salzmann, U., Risebrobakken, B., De Schepper, S., Pound, M.J., 2016. Climate 767 variability and long-term expansion of peatlands in Arctic Norway during the late 768 Pliocene (ODP Site 642, Norwegian Sea). Clim. Past 12, 1043–1060. doi:10.5194/cpd-769 11-5755-2015 770 Raymo, M.E., Grant, B., Horowitz, M., Rau, G.H., 1996. Mid-Pliocene warmth: stronger 771 greenhouse and stronger conveyor. Mar. Micropaleontol. 27, 313–326. 772 doi:10.1016/0377-8398(95)00048-8 773 Raymo, M.E., Hodell, D., Jansen, E., 1992. Response of deep ocean circulation to initiation of Northern Hemisphere glaciation (3–2 Ma). Paleoceanography 7, 645–672. 774 775 doi:10.1029/92pa01609 776 Risebrobakken, B., Andersson, C., De Schepper, S., McClymont, E.L., 2016. Low frequency 777 Pliocene climate variability on the eastern Nordic Seas. Paleoceanography 31, 1154-778 1175. doi:10.1002/2015PA002918 779 Salzmann, U., Dolan, A.M., Haywood, A.M., Chan, W.-L., Voss, J., Hill, D.J., Abe-Ouchi, 780 A., Otto-Bliesner, B., Bragg, F.J., Chandler, M.A., Contoux, C., Dowsett, H.J., Jost, A., 781 Kamae, Y., Lohmann, G., Lunt, D.J., Pickering, S.J., Pound, M.J., Ramstein, G., 782 Rosenbloom, N.A., Sohl, L., Stepanek, C., Ueda, H., Zhang, Z., 2013. Challenges in 783 quantifying Pliocene terrestrial warming revealed by data-model discord. Nat. Clim. 784 Chang. 3, 969–974. 785 Schreck, M., Meheust, M., Stein, R., Matthiessen, J., 2013. Response of marine 786 palynomorphs to Neogene climate cooling in the Iceland Sea (ODP Hole 907A). Mar. 787 Micropaleontol. 101, 49-67. doi:10.1016/j.marmicro.2013.03.003 788 Schulz, M., Mudelsee, M., 2002. REDFIT: Estimating red-noise spectra directly from 789 unevenly spaced paleoclimatic time series. Comput. Geosci. 28, 421-426. 790 doi:10.1016/S0098-3004(01)00044-9 791 Shipboard Scientific Party, 1987. 4. Site 642: Norwegian Sea, in: Eldholm, O., Thiede, J., 792 Taylor, E. (Eds.), . Init. Repts., 104: College Station, TX (Ocean Drilling Program), pp. 793 53-453. 794 St. John, K.E.K., Krissek, L.A., 2002. The late Miocene to Pleistocene ice-rafting history of 795 southeast Greenland. Boreas 28-35. 796 Steph, S., Tiedemann, R., Prange, M., Groeneveld, J., Schulz, M., Timmermann, A., 797 Nürnberg, D., Rühlemann, C., Saukel, C., Haug, G.H., 2010. Early Pliocene increase in 798 thermohaline overturning: A precondition for the development of the modern equatorial

- Pacific cold tongue. Paleoceanography 25, 1–17. doi:10.1029/2008PA001645
- Stockmarr, J., 1971. Tablets with spores used in absolute pollen analysis. Pollen et spores 13,
   615–621.
- 802 Torrence, C., Compo, G. ~P. G.P., 1998. A practical guide to wavelet analysis. Bull. Am.
   803 Meteorol. Soc. 79, 61–78. doi:10.1175/1520-0477(1998)079<0061:APGTWA>2.0.CO;2
- Traverse, A., 1988. Production, dispersal, and sedimentation of spores/pollen, in:
  Paleopalynology. UNWIN HYMAN, London, pp. 375–430.
- 806 Utescher, T., Dreist, A., Henrot, A.-J., Hickler, T., Liu, Y.-S.C., Mosbrugger, V., Portmann,
  807 F.T., Salzmann, U., 2017. Continental climate gradients in North America and Western
  808 Eurasia before and after the closure of the Central American Seaway. Earth Planet. Sci.
  809 Lett. 472, 120–130.
- Verhoeven, K., Louwye, S., Eiríksson, J., 2013. Plio-Pleistocene landscape and vegetation
  reconstruction of the coastal area of the Tjörnes Peninsula, Northern Iceland. Boreas 42,
  108–122. doi:10.1111/j.1502-3885.2012.00279.x
- Verhoeven, K., Louwye, S., Eiríksson, J., De Schepper, S., 2011. A new age model for the
  Pliocene-Pleistocene Tjörnes section on Iceland: Its implication for the timing of North
  Atlantic-Pacific palaeoceanographic pathways. Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.
  309, 33–52. doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2011.04.001
- Willard, D.A., 1996. Pliocene-Pleistocene pollen assemblages from the Yermak Plateau,
  Arctic Ocean: Sites 910 and 911. Proc. Ocean Drill. Program, Sci. Results 151, 297–
  305.
- Willard, D.A., 1994. Palynological record from the North Atlantic region at 3 Ma:
  vegetational distribution during a period of global warmth. Rev. Palaeobot. Palynol. 83,
  275–297. doi:10.1016/0034-6667(94)90141-4
- Zhang, Z.S., Nisancioglu, K.H., Chandler, M.A., Haywood, A.M., Otto-Bliesner, B.L.,
  Ramstein, G., Stepanek, C., Abe-Ouchi, A., Chan, W.L., Bragg, F.J., Contoux, C.,
  Dolan, A.M., Hill, D.J., Jost, A., Kamae, Y., Lohmann, G., Lunt, D.J., Rosenbloom,
  N.A., Sohl, L.E., Ueda, H., 2013. Mid-Pliocene Atlantic Meridional Overturning
  Circulation not unlike modern. Clim. Past 9, 1495–1504. doi:10.5194/cp-9-1495-2013